Currently, the media boasts nearly 4,000 journalists in print and electronic media. However, they are concentrated in cities and towns, where access to facilities is easier than in rural areas.



LANZANIA

Under the leadership of President Jakaya Kikwete, Tanzania's democracy has continued to grow with the formation of new political parties as the country prepares for the next general elections, scheduled for October 2010. The country is governed under a multiparty political system introduced in 1999 by the late Mwalimu Julius Nyerere before he died. So far, three elections have been held, with one party, CCM, winning all.

Likewise, the media sector in Tanzania has continued to grow, with new investors showing interest despite the high taxes demanded by the government. The Aga Khan Media Group recently started new newspapers and a radio and television station in Dar-es-Salaam city, joining other local businessmen like Mengi, who have begun to venture into the sector.

The number of journalists has also grown, with new graduates coming out of the many mushrooming media-training institutions. Currently, the media boasts nearly 4,000 journalists in print and electronic media. However, they are concentrated in cities and towns, where access to facilities is easier than in rural areas.

Freedoms of speech and association are widely enjoyed by Tanzanians, including the members of the opposition and journalists. The new media bill, which was in pipeline when the last MSI was conducted, has not yet been passed into law and consultations with all stakeholders are still on. There are fears that the passage of this bill will affect press freedom and the freedom of expression that journalists have enjoyed for many decades. There are also several draconian media laws that the Tanzanian government inherited from colonial rule: some of these laws have become entirely useless, while others are maintained on the books so that the government can use them whenever it wants to suppress press freedom.

The increasing number of journalists also has been reflected in the emergence of new journalists' associations. Many of them are small and target specific sectors of the media, such as the environment, education, health, sports, etc. Tanzania boasts more than 20 media associations, some of which have national, regional, and niche interests. The Tanzanian media, through their different associations, have occasionally challenged the new media bill and the colonial media laws, but without much success.

TANZANIA AT A GLANCE

GENERAL

- > Population: 41,048,532 (July 2009 est., CIA World Factbook)
- > Capital city: Dar es Salaam
- > Ethnic groups (% of population): African 99% (of which 95% are Bantu consisting of more than 130 tribes), other 1% (CIA World Factbook)
- > Religions (% of population): mainland Christian 30%, Muslim 35%, indigenous beliefs 35%; Zanzibar - more than 99% Muslim (CIA World Factbook)
- > Languages (% of population): Kiswahili or Swahili (official), Kiunguja, English, Arabic, many local languages (CIA World Factbook)
- > GNI (2007-Atlas): \$16.29 billion (World Bank Development Indicators, 2008)
- > GNI per capita (2007-PPP): \$1,200 (World Bank Development Indicators, 2008)
- > Literacy rate: 69.4% (male 77.5%, female 62.2%) (2002 census, CIA World Factbook)
- > President or top authority: President Jakaya Kikwete (since December 21, 2005)

MEDIA-SPECIFIC

- > Number of active print outlets, radio stations, television stations: Print: 10+ (defined by panelists as "serious papers"); Radio Stations: 40+; Television Stations: 10+
- > Newspaper circulation statistics: Top three by circulation: Mwananchi (private, circulation 32,000); Tanzania Daima (private, circulation 28,000); Nipashe (private, circulation 25,000). Additionally, two government newspapers with significantly less circulation: Uhuru (circulation 12,000) Habari Leo (circulation 6,500)
- > Broadcast ratings: Radio One (private), Radio Free Africa (private) Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation Radio (state-run)
- > News agencies: Tanzania News Agency (state-owned), Press Services of Tanzania (private)
- > Annual advertising revenue in media sector: N/A
- > Internet usage: 400,000 (2007 est., CIA World Factbook)

MEDIA SUSTAINABILITY INDEX: TANZANIA SUSTAINABLI NEAR SUSTAINABILITY **SUSTAINABILIT** 2.65 2.31 2.08 UNSUSTAINABLE MIXED SYSTEM 1.97 1.70 UNSUSTAINABLE ANTI-FREE PRESS FREE SPEECH PROFESSIONAL PLURALITY OF NEWS SOURCES BUSINESS MANAGEMENT SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS OBJECTIVES

Country does not meet or only minimally meets objectives. Government and laws actively hinder free media development, professionalism is low, and media-industry activity is minimal.

Unsustainable, Anti-Free Press (0-1):

Unsustainable Mixed System (1-2): Country minimally meets objectives, with segments of the legal system and government opposed to a free media system. Evident progress in free-press advocacy, increased professionalism, and new media businesses may be too recent to judge sustainability.

Near Sustainability (2-3): Country has progressed in meeting multiple objectives, with legal norms, professionalism, and the business environment supportive of independent media. Advances have survived changes in government and have been codified in law and practice. However, more time may be needed to ensure that change is enduring and that increased professionalism and the media business environment are sustainable.

Sustainable (3-4): Country has media that are considered generally professional, free, and sustainable, or to be approaching these objectives. Systems supporting independent media have survived multiple governments, economic fluctuations, and changes in public opinion or social conventions.

MEDIA SUSTAINABILITY INDEX 2008

OBJECTIVE 1: FREEDOM OF SPEECH Tanzania Objective Score: 2.65

Tanzanians, including the media, continue to enjoy freedom of speech and of assembly, as there are clear provisions in the national constitution that guarantee these freedoms. The panelists noted that the judiciary is independent of government, and journalists have benefited from this by winning some of the cases filed against them or by them. Tanzanians have no restrictions on Internet access and use of Internet services or web sites.

However, there are still some laws in the country that some government officials use to restrict journalists from accessing "confidential" public information. Journalists who have accessed and published such information have become victims of government prosecution. These laws include the Newspaper Act of 1976, which limits access to some public information, the Official Secrets Act, and the Police and Prisons Act, which restricts freedom of the press.

Examples of this are journalists arrested by Songea District Commissioner Tarime Mabiti while they were trying to get information on ethnic clashes in his area.

Panelists view these laws as contradictory to the national constitution and feel that the state should abolish these laws.

The panelists agreed that licensing of broadcasting media has improved and become more transparent, compared with last year when the MSI study was conducted. They also noted that despite the problems with the licensing process, it is still better, in their opinion, than in any other country in the region and added that this also applies to print media. Electronic media are licensed by the Tanzania Communications Regulatory Authority, while print media are handled by a body called MAILEZO—the Tanzania National Department of Information Services—which works independently of government.

The restriction on area of coverage by a radio or television stations is still in place, but in reality it does not apply because of modern technology. One panelist said that it has become difficult for the government to monitor the coverage area of some radio stations' signals.

The panelists said that media entry into the market is free aside from licensing. The only problem is the tax structure, which has set high rates on all inputs used by the media, especially in the newspaper sector. The taxes on newsprint and the VAT on advertisements and other materials needed for newspaper production are high compared with other businesses. President Kikwete's promise to reduce taxes on inputs required by media outlets during his campaign has not materialized. This has resulted in a high cost of newspapers and has pushed away some would-be consumers.

The panelists noted that cases of violence against journalists are increasing, which has brought about some fear in certain sections of the media, especially those who cover violent crimes.

They cited a case from January 2008 where thugs attacked a newsroom of *Mwana Halisi* newspaper at around 8:00 in the evening and poured acid on two editors, Saed Kubenea and Ndimara Tegambwage. They were rushed to hospital in Dar-es-Salaam city, where they were treated and discharged after a month.

The panelists noted that the police arrested five suspects, who they charged and remanded to prison, but the case has not yet been concluded. "What we are sure of is that justice is being done," said one panelist.

The panelists agreed that both the state and private media are governed in the same way and that laws make little distinction between the two. However, in practice preferential treatment is given to the state media when it comes to accessing information from the government.

Moderator Godfrey Kambenga noted that although the government appoints editors and managers for the public media, they have some editorial independence. However, they cannot publish stories that are critical of the state. He added that they can only lift a story seen as critical from another publication and use it to defend the government.

LEGAL AND SOCIAL NORMS PROTECT AND PROMOTE FREE SPEECH AND ACCESS TO PUBLIC INFORMATION.

FREE-SPEECH INDICATORS:

- > Legal and social protections of free speech exist and are enforced.
- > Licensing of broadcast media is fair, competitive, and apolitical.
- > Market entry and tax structure for media are fair and comparable to other industries.
- Crimes against journalists or media outlets are prosecuted vigorously, but occurrences of such crimes are rare.
- > State or public media do not receive preferential legal treatment, and law guarantees editorial independence.
- > Libel is a civil law issue; public officials are held to higher standards, and offended parties must prove falsity and malice.
- Public information is easily accessible; right of access to information is equally enforced for all media and journalists.
- > Media outlets have unrestricted access to information; this is equally enforced for all media and journalists.
- Entry into the journalism profession is free, and government imposes no licensing, restrictions, or special rights for journalists.

Interference from the government or powerful businesses in the public media is common but in most cases indirect, said one panelist.

Libel is treated as a civil rather than criminal matter in Tanzania. Fines given by the courts are too high, and in some cases they have forced some media houses to close or be liquidated. However, the panelists noted that things have started to change with the establishment of the independent Media Council of Tanzania (MCT), which settles defamation cases.

If a media house or journalist is found guilty of an offense, they are asked to publish an apology and pay a small fee to the offended person or institution. The panelists added that the MCT is also respected by the government.

Public information is freely available, depending on how it portrays the government. If information is not considered "negative," it can be freely provided to both state and private media. Negative information is either withheld altogether or else reported with an angle favorable to the government by the state media.

The panelists stated that public information that may be useful is not easily available to the media from the state. The government gives information only to private media that favor it, said Alpha Isaya Nuhu, a panelist. He added that private media are sometimes turned away or blocked from covering certain functions organized by the government.

The panelists agreed that there is no restriction on accessing international news sources by media outlets, but the only problem that may prohibit access is affordability.

Entry into the journalism profession is open, and one does not need to be qualified. However, the panelists noted that this has resulted in many problems for the profession.

The government has come up with a proposal in the new media bill on minimum qualifications for someone wishing to be a journalist. A diploma may be required, but the stakeholders have not yet agreed on it.

OBJECTIVE 2: PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISM

Tanzania Objective Score: 2.08

The panelists agreed that most journalists in Tanzania report objectively and follow the required steps to prepare balanced stories. However, the objectivity varies and how it is perceived depends on the consumers of their products. Some journalists are seen as pro-government, while others are against the government. The panelists noted that there is a need to shed off this status from the community. The panelists added that although a code of ethics in line with the international standards exists and most journalists respect it, there are still a few violations. However, they noted that the MCT, which is charged with its implementation, has done a great job by following up such cases and punishing culprits.

The panelists pointed to two cases in particular. One involves Zephania Mushendo, who demanded a bribe from the director general of the Tanzania Anti-Corruption Bureau and was arrested, charged, and sentenced to five years in prison. Another journalist, Patrick Chambo, was arrested on corruption charges and sentenced to three years.

Self-censorship continues to prevail in Tanzania at different editorial levels in most of the media outlets, but it is more common in state-owned media. Those who practice it do so for different reasons, ranging from financial gains and job protection to the editorial policies of the media houses they work for, political allegiance, etc.

"We have seen stories on corruption in government being dropped or blocked by our senior editor after receiving calls from state officials," said a panelist who works with a state newspaper.

Another panelist added that even in private media, big stories about some companies are removed because of business interests and fear of losing advertising money from such companies.

Journalists have continued to cover key events, especially when they are invited or tipped off, but security-related issues are rarely covered by the media because of their sensitivity, the panelists noted. One obstacle to covering some events is that journalists from some media houses have been turned away from certain functions by organizers for undisclosed

JOURNALISM MEETS PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS OF QUALITY.

PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISM INDICATORS:

- > Reporting is fair, objective, and well sourced.
- > Journalists follow recognized and accepted ethical standards.
- > Journalists and editors do not practice self-censorship.
- > Journalists cover key events and issues.
- > Pay levels for journalists and other media professionals are sufficiently high to discourage corruption.
- > Entertainment programming does not eclipse news and information programming.
- > Technical facilities and equipment for gathering, producing, and distributing news are modern and efficient.
- > Quality niche reporting and programming exists (investigative, economics/business, local, political).

reasons, but the panelists said it is because the journalists are considered to be "negative."

Pay levels for journalists have remained low, compared with other sectors, despite the rising inflation rate. The panelists said this has promoted corruption in the media profession. Reporters prefer killing good stories in exchange for money because they find it more lucrative than running them in their media houses.

As the rate of unemployment has risen, many journalists are working as freelancers under poor conditions, with little or no pay.

The broadcasting sector, especially program announcers and presenters, are better paid than their colleagues in the print media. The panelists noted that it is becoming a fashion in Tanzania for some journalists to want their name to appear in newspapers and get paid by the news source instead of the media house he or she works for.

The Employment Labor Relations Act of 2004, enacted in 2006, would have addressed the above problems but has never been implemented.

The panelists agreed that entertainment programming is most prominent in the media because consumers are more interested in entertainment than news.

A few media houses have managed to import modern facilities and equipment for use in news gathering and broadcasting. Such equipment includes digital studio equipment, recorders, and digital video and still cameras, which have helped to produce better-quality news reports.

OBJECTIVE 3: PLURALITY OF NEWS

Tanzania Objective Score: 2.59

There are many sources of information, encompassing both electronic and print media. There are more than 45 radio stations, 10 television stations, 15 cable television providers, 24 daily newspapers (some of them regional), and more than 60 weekly and monthly newspapers. Tanzania has also some newspapers that come out seasonally to target particular campaigns.

The panelists noted that most media outlets are concentrated in cities because of market and economic factors. However, both private and state media (broadcast and print) cover all parts of the country. Most people depend on electronic media, particularly radio, for information because it is more affordable than buying newspapers. Although radio is a vital source of information for rural people, in some areas they cannot afford to buy batteries for their radio sets. Districts are setting up new radio stations for their areas, and some radio stations have been set up for refugees. The stations broadcast in Kinyarwanda and Kirundi languages, which are understood well by the beneficiaries.

There are no government restrictions on accessing foreign or domestic news sources. The panelists agreed that citizens mainly access foreign radio or television broadcasts rather than foreign print titles. For those who can afford it, the Internet also provides access to foreign news. The Internet is available primarily in cities and towns.

Changes in state media have started to take place, with allocation of a little time to opposing views despite the fact that it is fully controlled by the government. These gradual changes are seen mainly in the television sector.

A new private news agency, Press Service of Tanzania, has been started by the IPP Media group, which owns a television and radio station in addition to a newspaper. However, few media houses use news stories from this agency. There are also several foreign news agencies that are used by local media outlets on a subscription basis. The panelists agreed that their fees are affordable.

Private broadcast media generally produce their own programs, but news segments come from different sources, including the government. Therefore, these programs do not effectively add a different perspective.

The media ownership situation has not changed much from last year's survey. The panelists said that most, if not all, media house owners are known and that anybody interested in finding this information may do so easily. However,

MULTIPLE NEWS SOURCES PROVIDE CITIZENS WITH RELIABLE AND OBJECTIVE NEWS.

PLURALITY OF NEWS SOURCES INDICATORS:

- A plurality of affordable public and private news sources (e.g., print, broadcast, Internet) exists.
- > Citizens' access to domestic or international media is not restricted.
- > State or public media reflect the views of the entire political spectrum, are nonpartisan, and serve the public interest.
- > Independent news agencies gather and distribute news for print and broadcast media.
- > Independent broadcast media produce their own news programs.
- Transparency of media ownership allows consumers to judge objectivity of news; media ownership is not concentrated in a few conglomerates.
- > A broad spectrum of social interests are reflected and represented in the media, including minority-language information sources.

they noted a recent trend where groups of investors or companies have started to dominate media ownership. A case in point is the Nation Group, which owns a newspaper, radio station, and television channel. Another example is IPP Media, a consumer products company that also owns several publications, FM stations, and television channels.

A minority-language issue does not exist in Tanzania because all citizens speak Swahili, and most media use this language. However, one panelist noted that there is a group of people called "Bushmen" in Central Tanzania whom the media have failed to report on for decades.

OBJECTIVE 4: BUSINESS MANAGEMENT Tanzania Objective Score: 2.21

The panelists noted that most media houses are well-managed, profit-making businesses, with owners employing professionals in senior positions. However, they said there are a few poorly managed media houses whose owners employ family members.

Community media are very difficult to sustain because of high operating costs and unsteady revenue. This has led to closures in some areas.

Private media owners finance their businesses through savings and bank loans to supplement sales of copies and revenue from advertising. Relying on subscriptions or proceeds from sales is risky, panelists said, because some agents and vendors at times run away with media house funds. This mainly affects small companies that depend on newspaper sales. The government does not subsidize private media.

INDEPENDENT MEDIA ARE WELL-MANAGED BUSINESSES, ALLOWING EDITORIAL INDEPENDENCE.

BUSINESS MANAGEMENT INDICATORS:

- > Media outlets and supporting firms operate as efficient, professional, and profit-generating businesses.
- > Media receive revenue from a multitude of sources.
- Advertising agencies and related industries support an advertising market.
- Advertising revenue as a percentage of total revenue is in line with accepted standards at commercial outlets.
- > Independent media do not receive government subsidies.
- Market research is used to formulate strategic plans, enhance advertising revenue, and tailor products to the needs and interests of audiences.
- Broadcast ratings and circulation figures are reliably and independently produced.

The panelists agreed that advertising revenue affects editorial independence at most media outlets because very few media houses can risk running stories critical of their clients.

Though the advertising industry is still in its infancy, efforts are being made by media owners, managers, and advertising personnel to establish an infrastructure to help its growth. In some cases, advertisements are already run at the expense of news space. News takes up 60 percent of space in newspapers, and advertisements typically occupy 40 percent. However, at times advertisements are allowed to take up more space if managers need to increase revenue. This sometimes causes stories to be dropped at the last minute to create space for late advertisements, panelists said.

Some media outlets conduct market research, but the results are rarely applied to a business strategy. This holds back media growth in terms of circulation and volume of advertisements.

In most cases, media houses hire independent firms, like Steadman, to carry out this research. But even the findings are not made public, especially when it comes to circulation figures and broadcast ratings. According to the panelists, most media owners want to keep their revenue and audience or circulation figures secret.

Some media houses have publicly opposed these findings, but anybody interested in such information can get it from Steadman at a fee. Some media houses prefer to conduct their own research and come up with unrealistic figures to attract business, noted Epson Raphael Luhwago, a panelist.

OBJECTIVE 5: SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS Tanzania Objective Score: 2.63

Several trade and professional associations exist in Tanzania, but some of them have been forced to close because of declining membership. Many of these associations benefited only their leaders and had become of no use to their members.

However, some strong associations have managed to survive, including the Tanzania Union of Journalists, the MCT, the Tanzania Media Women's Association, and the Media Owner's Association of Tanzania.

Most of these associations carry out several activities, including training, but they depend on donations as a source of revenue. Unfortunately, their members rarely pay their fees, yet they expect to benefit from the services offered, said Kambenga, the moderator.

Several NGOs support journalists and media-related causes. They include the Center for Basic Human Rights, the Tanzania Gender Networking Program, and the National Organization for Legal Aid. Apart from defending journalists' rights, these organizations also fund some training programs.

The panelists noted that more new media training institutions have been started to supplement the existing colleges. Tanzania also has three universities that offer degrees in journalism and mass communications. They include the State University of Dar-es-Salaam, St. Augustine University, and Tumani University. Several other colleges provide diploma and certificate courses in journalism, but the panelists noted that the government has stepped in to control the quality of courses offered by these institutions after complaints from several members of the journalism profession.

Many graduates from these institutions end up as freelancers, as few media houses can hire them on a permanent basis.

In-house training opportunities also exist in some media houses and have benefited the journalists who work there. However, they cannot afford to attend the formal training institutions.

Training opportunities abroad and exchange programs used to be available but are not presently. However, some international organizations—like IFJ, which works with local NGOs—have assisted in training journalists in Tanzania through short courses. This has helped those who joined the profession without formal media training. These training efforts help journalists acquire new skills. Such courses are fully sponsored by the organizers, and attendees do not pay any registration fees.

Printing facilities and access to newsprint are now free, unlike in the past, when Tanzania was under one-party rule. During those times, the two biggest printers, Print Pack and Uhuru, were restricted to printing only state papers and those

SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS FUNCTION IN THE PROFESSIONAL INTERESTS OF INDEPENDENT MEDIA.

SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS INDICATORS:

- > Trade associations represent the interests of private media owners and provide member services.
- > Professional associations work to protect journalists' rights.
- > NGOs support free speech and independent media.
- > Quality journalism degree programs that provide substantial practical experience exist.
- Short-term training and in-service training programs allow journalists to upgrade skills or acquire new skills.
- Sources of newsprint and printing facilities are in private hands, apolitical, and unrestricted.
- > Channels of media distribution (kiosks, transmitters, Internet) are private, apolitical, and unrestricted.

that supported the government. There are several private printers today, and many businesses import newsprint and sell it to media without restriction. Panelists depicted printing companies as profitable, even lucrative.

Distribution of newspapers is done by private-sector companies through a network of agents and vendors who are able to reach significant parts of the country. State media also rely in part on private businesses for distribution. Vehicles and kiosks are used to distribute print media in cities, while papers are sold in supermarkets and small shops outside large cities. However, delivery delays regularly occur, especially for small print media. This distribution is carried out without political interference.

List of Panel Participants

Shani Kibwasali, journalist, gender coordinator, Tanzania Union of Journalists, Dar-es-Salaam

Epson Raphael Luhwago, editor, Uhuru Publications, Dar-es-Salaam

Mngumi Gaudensia, journalist and member, Tanzania Media Women Association, Mwanza and Dar-es-Salaam

John Ngunge, journalist, Radio One FM, Dar-es-Salaam

Hamid Yassin Russaulte, news editor, Hoja newspaper, Dar-es-Salaam

Pius Ntiga, reporter, Radio Uhuru, Dar-es-Salaam

Samuel Kamndaya, correspondent, Mwanainchi Communications, Arusha

Beatrice Bandawe, news editor, *Nipashe* newspaper, Dar-es-Salaam

Boniface Luhanga, chief sub-editor, The Guardian newspaper, Dar-es-Salaam

Alpha Isaya Nuhu, features editor, *Habari* newspaper, Mombasa

Paul Mallimbo, editor, Press Services of Tanzania, Dar-es-Salaam

Moderator and Author

Godfrey Kambenga, journalist and general secretary, Tanzania Union of Journalists, Dar-es-Salaam

Coordinator

Herbert Mukasa Lumansi, vice president, Uganda Journalists Association, Kampala, Uganda in cooperation with the Tanzania Union of Journalists